



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

United States Patent and Trademark Office

Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/783,130	02/20/2004	Laszlo Domokos	TS1461 (US)	1254
23632	7590	11/26/2008		
SHELL OIL COMPANY				
P O BOX 2463				
HOUSTON, TX 772522463				
EXAMINER				
NGUYEN, CAM N				
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
1793				
MAIL DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
11/26/2008		PAPER		

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

# Office Action Summary

**Application No.**

10/783,130

**Applicant(s)**

DOMOKOS ET AL.

**Examiner**

Cam N. Nguyen

**Art Unit**

1793

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --  
**Period for Reply**

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

**Status**

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 08/20/08 (an amendment/response).
- 2a) ☒ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

**Disposition of Claims**

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-36, 40-47 and 49-56 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) 7-26 is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☒ Claim(s) 28-35, 40-47 and 49-56 is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-6, 27, & 36 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

**Application Papers**

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

**Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119**

- 12) ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☒ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:
1. ☒ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

**Attachment(s)**

- 1) ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-849)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application
- 6) ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_

**DETAILED ACTION**

**Response to Amendment**

1. The amendment filed on 08/20/08 has been made of record and entered. Claims 1, 6, 40, & 49 have been amended. Claims 37-39 & 48 have been canceled.

Claims 1-36, 40-47, & 49-56 are currently pending in this application.

**Status of Withdrawn Claim(s)**

2. This application contains claims 7-26 which drawn to an invention nonelected with traverse in the reply filed on 03/11/08. A complete reply to the final rejection must include cancellation of nonelected claims or other appropriate action (37 CFR 1.144) See MPEP § 821.01.

**Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112 (Second Paragraph)**

3. The following is a quotation of the second paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:

The specification shall conclude with one or more claims particularly pointing out and distinctly claiming the subject matter which the applicant regards as his invention.

Claims 1-6 & 27 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention.

Claim 1 recites the limitation "...are combined together prior to shaping said unsupported catalyst composition" in lines 4-5. There is insufficient antecedent basis for this limitation in the

claim. The instant claim is drawn to a “composition” and there is no other process limitation in the claim to support the claimed limitation.

**Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103**

4. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claim 36 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Takeuchi et al., “hereinafter referred to as Takeuchi”, (US Pat. 4,206,036).

Takeuchi discloses a catalyst comprising 45 to 95% by weight of titanium oxide, 3 to 40% by weight of at least one of molybdenum oxide and tungsten oxide, and 2 to 15% by weight of at least one nickel oxide and cobalt oxide (see col. 14, claim 1, ln 30-34). Takeuchi further discloses that the titanium oxide can be replaced with a small amount of refractory materials, such as alumina, silica, etc. (see col. 4, ln 49-53). See also col. 4, ln 24-30.

Takeuchi teaches the claimed unsupported catalyst composition containing the claimed metal components and metal amounts. The instantly claimed metal concentrations appear to be falling within and/or overlapping with the disclosed metal concentrations. It is considered the claimed catalyst composition is obvious over the catalyst composition of the reference because one having the ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made would have been envisaged to choose the claimed metal concentrations in order to achieve an effective catalyst composition, in view of *In re Schauzmann*.

**Response to Applicants' Arguments**

5. The amendment and remarks filed on 08/20/08 has been fully reconsidered, but not deemed persuasive because of the following reasons.

Applicants' urging regarding 112 (second paragraph) made in the last office action is noted. While that limitation has sufficient support in the instant specification, it does not have sufficient antecedent basis in the claim. It is suggested that applicants amend the claim to positively reciting the structure and composition of the catalyst as opposed to the process steps.

The rejection made over claim 36 is maintained because applicants did not address this rejection in the amendment.

6. **THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL.** Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

**Conclusion**

7. Claims 1-36, 40-47, & 49-56 are pending. Claims 1-6, 27, & 36 are rejected. Claims 7-26 remain withdrawn due to non-elected (distinct) invention(s). Claims 28-35, 40-47 & 49-56 are allowed.

**Contacts**

8. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Primary Examiner Cam N Nguyen, whose telephone number is 571-272-1357. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F, 9:00 AM - 6:30 PM, at alternative work site.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Stanley Silverman, can be reached on 571-272-1358. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-272-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

/Cam N. Nguyen/

Primary Examiner

Art Unit: 1793

/C. N. N./

November 21, 2008